

cek plagiarisme.docx

By Kak Ryani

WORD COUNT

4417

TIME SUBMITTED

16-AUG-2021 02:58PM

PAPER ID

75592801

Digital Story Telling Based on Multimodal Elements on Speaking Performance for EFL Learners

Abstract

This study examined the effectiveness of digital storytelling based on multimodal elements on EFL learners' speaking performance. A quasi-experimental design with a control and experimental group was employed. The sample consisted of 40 students of Teacher Education of Early Childhood Education in a private university in Pontianak. Both classes studied English for Early Childhood Education. Sample in the experimental group was treated by digital storytelling based on multimodal elements and local contents. The control group studied the storytelling based on a conventional video. The ANCOVA test proved that $\text{Sig} = 0.000 < 0.05$ means that digital storytelling with multimodal elements effectively enhances EFL learners speaking performance. The descriptive statistics show that students in the experimental group ($M=85.4$) significantly outperformed the control group ($M=76.9$) on their speaking performance mediated by digital storytelling. The students perceived a positive perception of digital storytelling based on multimodal elements in learning English in terms of enjoyment of multimodal features such as visual and auditory and values depicted from local values. The study also explored several perceived obstacles in using digital storytelling based on multimodal elements in speaking, such as digital and technical literacy, language skill, creativity and innovative thinking, and collaborative learning.

Keywords: digital, storytelling, multimodal, speaking performance

Background

The dynamic changes of educational technology in language learning have assisted many EFL teachers worldwide to be creative to select, provide and utilize the digital platforms in language learning. The rapid advancement of technology should also be synergized with multimodal elements. The values depicted from digital storytelling and intrinsic characteristics can be best enriched by the audiovisual images and sounds for English language learning. Educators must adopt and adapt the contextual model of teaching and learning embedded with educational technology as a robust synergy to improve teaching and learning English quality. This current study attempted to examine the effectiveness of digital storytelling incorporated with multimodal elements. Integrating local values within the digital story telling can help the students better learn the language as the ideas have a solid connection to their daily, cultural, and social lives.

The adoption of digital storytelling in language learning bestows a supportive condition for the students to practice their linguistics and communication competence, digital skills, autonomous learning skill, art, and social-cultural approaches based on multimodal approaches (Gregori-Signes, 2014). When students create digital storytelling, they will convey their potential ideas and use their best capacity to produce lively digital storytelling. Storytelling can function as a favourable education tool to share knowledge and pass social-cultural heritage to a broader audience and future

inheritance (Smeda et al., 2014). The effect of technological sophistication allows storytelling to be presented through digital media platforms. Digital storytelling provides a meaningful technology by combining texts, images, and audio to be creative form of storytelling to enhance students' speaking skills (Somdee & Suppasetserree, 2013).

The application of digital storytelling in English language learning is affirmed by the constructivist learning theory and the multiliteracies of cultural values of the society. The process of learning mediated by digital storytelling can encourage students' personal and cultural identity (Stanley, 2018). The significance of digital literacy is essential as one of the 21st-century life skills for university students since they must be able to address their ideas in the digital platform (Chan et al., 2017). Digital storytelling exhibits some benefits for language learning, such as enhancing linguistics communication, digital and learning skills, learning autonomy encouragement, and individual initiative (Gregori-Signes, 2014). Moreover, when students participate in digital storytelling, they can be assisted to entail multimodal skills in four language skills: listening, reading, speaking, and writing (Widodo, 2016). As a breakthrough in educational technology, digital storytelling can foster transformative-based technological learning that covers substantive material, critical thinking skills, technology literacy, and learning motivation (Moradi & Chen, 2019).

There have been numerous studies researched on the use of digital storytelling in English language learning. Still, few of them analyzed the incorporation of local content values-based multimodal elements portrayed and integrated into the digital storytelling. Kallinikou & Nicolaidou (2019) researched the use of digital storytelling to scaffold an interactive learning environment and how it enhanced students' speaking skills and motivation by using pretest and posttest. Their research mainly focused on the examination of motivational variables for EFL learners in Russia. They proved that digital storytelling mediated by a web-based learning environment enhanced students' speaking skills for the attributes of grammar, syntax, vocabulary, and pronunciation, and motivation in terms of interest, importance, usefulness, and self-efficacy. Similarly, Arroba & Acosta (2021) examined the effectiveness of authentic digital storytelling for fostering EFL learners' speaking in the university by focusing on communicative strategies. The study's findings emphasized the method of delivery, media used for the storyboard, and delivery of organization and message quality. A study by Hava (2019) explored the cultivation of digital storytelling to students' personal confidence and use as well as attitudes and it could facilitate language skills learning for conducive learning environment.

Based on some previous research, this study aimed to explore the effectiveness of digital storytelling mediated by incorporating local content based on the multimodal elements to improve students' speaking performance in learning English as a foreign language. This study did not merely analyze the effectiveness of digital storytelling on students' speaking performance and perception of its implementation but also entailed the perceived obstacles on the process of creating digital storytelling. Sanchez-Lopez et al. (2020) researched that the study of creating digital storytelling as a process is still very limited, and digital literature as one potential obstacle is worth investigating. In this study, the lecturer implemented a teaching and learning activity with digital storytelling. The samples of the study were taken from two customized classes from Teacher Education of Early Childhood Education, one as the control group and one as the experimental group. Each class consists of 20 students. The class was divided into four groups; each group consisted of 5 students. The control group was given materials on conventional storytelling, and the experimental group received treatment with digital storytelling with multimodal elements and local contents materials. The lecturer presented the materials for making digital storytelling and provided the topics for digital storytelling. The four topics are the renowned local cultures such as cultural attraction, culinary temptation, and traditional festivals. Both classes were presented through an online platform. The students then designed the storyboard for digital storytelling collaboratively with their friends. In the final part, both students from control and experimental were assigned to create their storytelling by conventional video and digital storytelling using the PowToon application as the sample given first hand in the classroom. The study focused on the effectiveness of digital storytelling mediated by multimodal elements on students' speaking performance. The research also explored the students' perception and their perceived obstacles integrating digital storytelling based multimodal elements in learning English. Based on the elucidation above, the problem statements can be formulated as follow:

1. Is there a significant difference in EFL learners' speaking performance between digital storytelling based on multimodal elements and conventional storytelling?
2. What are the students' perceptions on the incorporation of digital storytelling based on multimodal elements?
3. What are the students' perceived obstacles in incorporating digital storytelling based multimodal elements?

The hypothesis for the control group is as follows: null hypothesis: There is no significant difference in EFL learners speaking performance between digital storytelling based on multimodal elements and conventional storytelling, while the alternative hypothesis: there is a significant difference in EFL learners speaking performance between digital storytelling based on multimodal elements and conventional storytelling

RESEARCH METHOD

Method

The method of this research was a quasi-experimental design with a control and an experimental group. A speaking rubric by Cambridge English Qualification: Assessing Speaking Performance – Level A2, which covers speaking performance assessment (Cambridge English Qualification, 2011), was used. The rubric was used to collect quantitative data on students' speaking performance on digital storytelling. Questionnaires on students' perceptions and semi-structured interviews were also used to corroborate the research findings. The relevancy of using this method lies in response to the research questions that need the integrations of two forms of data and the results (Creswell & Clark, 2018).

Participant of the study

The samples of the study were taken from two customized classes from Teacher Education of Early Childhood Education Faculty by using a nonrandom sampling technique. Each class consists of 20 students. A control group was given a lecture on storytelling by using the conventional method. In contrast, an experimental group was given a course on designing digital storytelling by incorporating local values based on multimodal elements. The digital platform of digital storytelling utilized PowToon Education.

Procedures

Teaching storytelling was carried out for both the control and experimental group. Control group activity mediated by storytelling material that consists of deciding stories (topic and plot), making script, creating the videos, and sharing the stories. While, the experimental group received treatment of digital storytelling material consists of creating digital stories (topic, plot, and media-PowToon education). Local contents were explicitly elaborated with examples and simulations. The sample of digital storytelling talked about Culinary temptation. The lecturer also explained the steps to create digital storytelling by using the application, starting from picking slides, elements, actors, and back sound, practising video-over recordings, sharing the video on the YouTube Channel, and providing assessments from students as the feedback. After two meetings of treatments, the students were assigned a project to create digital storytelling. After the project was completed, the results were assessed its effectiveness between the control and the experimental group. Furthermore, the students' perception was also asked to posit their ideas on the use of digital storytelling based on multimodal elements on speaking skills. The final procedures examined students' perceived obstacles when experiencing this kind of activity.

Research Instruments and Data Analysis

This study applied subsequent research instruments, namely, the speaking rubric by Cambridge English Qualification: Assessing Speaking Performance – Level

A2, which cover the assessment of speaking performance: grammar and vocabulary (Cambridge English Qualification, 2011). The second research instrument was the questionnaires about students' perception in creating digital storytelling using PowToon. Data analysis for students' speaking performance consisted of the inter-reliability test, normality test, homogeneity, test of linearity, and ANCOVA. Questionnaires were tested using validity and reliability tests, and descriptive statistics analyzed students' perception. The last research instrument was a semi-structured interview that focused on perceived obstacles in implementing digital storytelling. The result of the interview was transcribed and coded to produce the emerging themes. The procedures of thematic analysis adopted inductive and deductive coding by (Xu & Zammit, 2020).

Findings and Discussion

Before the ANCOVA computation, the first early step was to examine whether the data met ANCOVA analysis's basic statistical assumption. There are statistical assumptions that need to be fulfilled in ANCOVA analysis, namely, inter-rater reliability, normality test, homogeneity of variances test, and test of linearity to find out the test of between-subject effects.

The first research question was to examine the effect of digital storytelling based multimodal elements of EFL learners in their speaking performance. As the test entailed the speaking activity, the pretest and posttest results were examined to find out the inter-rater reliability to avoid bias and subjectivity. The speaking performance test on digital storytelling was given by instruction by the same rubric. The score used continuum mode with correlation coefficient technique. The correlations showed that rater one dan rater two pretest-posttest experiments, rater one and rater two pretest-posttest control have almost perfect reliability degree based on the interpretation of the level of agreement by (Landis & Koch, 1977).

Table 1. Rater 1 and rater 2 pretest experiment

		Rater1_PreEx	Rater2_PreEx
Rater1_PreEx	8		
	Pearson Correlation	1	.935**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
Rater2_PreEx	N	20	20
	Pearson Correlation	.935**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	5	20	20

** . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 2. Rater 1 and rater 2 posttest experiment

		Rater1_PostEx	Rater2_PostEx
Rater1_PostEx	13	1	.931**
	Pearson Correlation		.000
	Sig. (2-tailed)		

	N	20	20
Rater2_PostEx	Pearson Correlation	.91**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	20	20

** . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 3. Rater 1 and rater 2 pretest control

		Rater1_PreCon	Rater2_PreCon
Rater1_PreCon	Pearson Correlation	1	.866**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.05
	N	20	20
Rater2_PreCon	Pearson Correlation	.866**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	20	20

** . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 4. Rater 1 and rater 2 posttest control

		Rater1_PostCon	Rater2_PostCon
Rater1_PostCon	Pearson Correlation	1	.934**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	N	20	20
Rater2_PostCon	Pearson Correlation	.934**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	20	20

** . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

A normality test was conducted to ensure the normality of the distribution of the score. As the sample consisted of below 50 students, the Shapiro-Wilk test was run. Table 5 displays the sign result of experimental pretest group .0753 (Sig. > α), pretest control group 0.10 ((Sig. > α), posttest experimental group 0.734 ((Sig. > α), and posttest control group 0.128 (Sig. > α). It can be concluded that the score of both the experimental and control group was distributed normally.

Table 5. Test of normality for the experimental and control groups in speaking performance with digital storytelling in pretest and posttest

		Shapiro-Wilk		
	Class	Statistic	df	Sig.
Pretest	Experimental Class	.970	20	.753
	Control Class	.867	20	.010
Posttest	Experimental Class	.969	20	.734
	Control Class	.926	20	.128

*. This is a lower bound of the true significance.

a. Lilliefors Significance Correction

After the assumption of normality test was fulfilled, a test of homogeneity was run. The output of Sig. based on Mean of the pretest was $.221 > 0.05$ and posttest $.538 > 0.05$. the results show that the homogeneity assumption was fulfilled and the variances were homogenous.

23

Table 6. Test of Homogeneity of Variances

		Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
Pretest	Based on Mean	1.547	1	38	.221
	Based on Median	1.858	1	38	.181
	Based on Median and with adjusted df	1.858	1	37.055	.181
	Based on trimmed mean	1.595	1	38	.214
Posttest	Based on Mean	.385	1	38	.538
	Based on Median	.496	1	38	.486
	Based on Median and with adjusted df	.496	1	34.345	.486
	Based on trimmed mean	.392	1	38	.535

Before ANCOVA was conducted, a test of linearity was run to examine the linearity of covariate with dependent variables. The table displays the score of pretest as covariate variable with Sig. $0.000 < \alpha 0.05$, which means that there is a linear correlation between the dependent variable.

1

Table 7. Test of Linearity

Dependent Variable: Posttest

Source	Type III Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Corrected Model	1821.107 ^a	2	910.554	60.023	.000
Intercept	192.042	1	192.042	12.659	.000
Pretest	1273.507	1	1273.507	83.949	.000
Class	500.010	1	500.010	32.960	.000
Error	561.293	37	15.170		
Total	219650.000	40			
Corrected Total	2382.400	39			

17

a. R Squared = .764 (Adjusted R Squared = .752)

Tests of between-subjects effects were also used to test the hypothesis. Based on the results, the Sig. of the variable class was $0.000 < 0.05$, which entails that the null hypothesis was rejected and the alternative hypothesis was accepted. There is a significant difference in speaking performance on students between digital storytelling with multimodal approach and conventional storytelling.

ANCOVA was conducted to examine the effectiveness of digital storytelling based multimodal elements on EFL learners' speaking performance. ANCOVA was run to test the null hypothesis that there is no significant difference in speaking performance on students between digital storytelling with multimodal approach and conventional storytelling and the alternative hypothesis that there is a significant difference in speaking performance on students between digital storytelling with multimodal approach and conventional storytelling. The output table of parameter estimates shows that $\text{Sig} = 0.000 < 0.05$ which signifies that digital storytelling with multimodal element is effective in teaching speaking performance to EFL learners.

Table 7. ANCOVA

Dependent Variable: Posttest

Parameter	B	Std. Error	t	Sig.	95% Confidence Interval	
					Lower Bound	Upper Bound
Intercept	17.161	5.832	2.942	.000	5.344	28.979
Pretest	.815	.089	9.162	.000	.635	.995
[Class=1.00]	7.074	1.232	5.741	.000	4.577	9.571
[Class=2.00]	0 ^a

a. This parameter is set to zero because it is redundant.

The descriptive statistics below showed that the mean score of students' speaking performance in the pretest with conventional storytelling was 55.7, while in the posttest, the mean score was 76.9.

Table 8. Descriptive Statistics of Control Group

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Pretest	20	41.00	70.00	65.7000	9.02103
Posttest	20	70.00	83.00	76.9000	3.71200
Class	20	2.00	2.00	2.0000	.00000
Valid N (listwise)	20				

As revealed by the descriptive statistics of the experimental group, the mean score of students' speaking performance in the pretest was 68.05, while the mean score of posttest after treatment with digital storytelling increased significantly 85.4.

Table 9. Descriptive Statistics of Experimental Group

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Pretest	20	56.00	77.00	68.0500	6.38646
Posttest	20	80.00	92.00	85.4000	3.87162
Class	20	1.00	1.00	1.0000	.00000
Valid N (listwise)	20				

The second research question aimed to explore the students' perception of digital storytelling based on multimodal elements in learning English. After that, the students were asked to opine their perceptions of the teaching and learning process. The majority of them conveyed strong agreement on using digital storytelling in learning English in terms of enjoyment of the multimodal elements. They perceive it as good to have digital storytelling as a tool for learning English (M=4.35), they enjoy speaking the stories mediated by digital storytelling (M=4.4), and they enjoy making stories where they combine multimodal elements such as images and visual elements (M= 4.55). Additionally, they enjoy acting out parts of the digital storytelling (M=4.35), and they enjoy learning English with local content in digital storytelling (M=4.35). Finally, they would like to have digital storytelling in learning English (4.35).

Table 10. Questionnaires Items of Students' Perception on Digital Storytelling

No	Items of questionnaire	Mean score	Standard Deviation
1	I have a good perception of digital storytelling as a tool for learning English language speaking	4.35	.58714
2	I enjoy speaking the stories in English with digital platforms	4.4	.50262
3	I enjoy making stories in English with multimodal elements such as images, and visual elements	4.55	.51042
4	I enjoy acting out parts of the stories read by reciting the story	4.35	.58714
5	I enjoy learning English with local content and content in digital storytelling	4.35	.48936
6	I enjoy learning English with multimodal elements	4.5	.51299

7	Visual images make me interested in learning English	4.35	.48936
8	Auditory elements make me interested in learning English	4.35	.48936
9	I would like digital storytelling to be included in learning English.	4.35	.67082

The third research question was to examine students' perceived obstacles in using digital storytelling based on multimodal elements. The data were taken and analyzed by transcribing and coding procedures of the interview. The procedures consisted of transcribing the interview, assigning categories, coding and highlighting essential themes. Then, the analysis and interpretation were deduced to get the final coding. Students' perceived obstacles are categorized into four main categories, namely, digital and technical literacy, language skills, creativity and innovative thinking, and collaborative learning. The themes can be presented in the following excerpts:

Digital and technical literacy

- P1* When designing digital storytelling, I need more guidance to combine the visual and audio elements for the story.
- P2* One of the most challenging problems in making digital storytelling is how to select digital platforms for my story
- P3* I am not familiar with digital platforms that combine multimedia elements, so the lecturer needs to posit specific technical steps.
- P4* It is not easy for me to select and adapt visual elements for the story.

Language skill

- P1* I still have lack of confidence to produce a suitable tone for my story.
- P2* Fluency is the biggest fear when creating digital storytelling because the message delivery cannot run well without fluency.
- P3* Hesitation when pronouncing the words exists. I tended to use isolated words
- P4* I find it challenging to create ideas by using a string of sentences.

Creativity and innovative thinking

- P1 Exposure of story, plot, and organization is needed. We need more practice of how to use artistic skills.*
- P2 It must previously happen of a brainstorming activity to bring new ideas presented in the story.*
- P3 The lecturer must provide feedback on the process of creating the story.*
- P4 The initial learning process should provide imagining, questioning, and simulating of thinking the concept for the storyboard.*

Collaborative learning

- P1 I think the group must consist of mixed-ability students, so we can learn from better role models when acting out the story.*
- P2 When there is no fixed rule of collaborative elements integrated into the digital storytelling, some voices were unheard, while others were dominant.*
- P3 Some members are still mutually independent; they were reluctant to give evaluation and feedback.*
- P4 Work division not only means on equal part of the story board, but also focuses on the overall process and the final product of the digital storytelling.*

The preceding data sources indicated that digital storytelling based on multimodal elements and local content significantly enhanced students' speaking performance. In the treatment phase, the students were exposed to the technical and substantial skills to create digital storytelling by utilizing multimodal elements such as visual and auditory elements. The students played their role to activate and embody the stories. They learnt collaboratively in selecting the material, making the plot, writing the script, and simulating the story's narration. Learning activity mediated by digital storytelling can situate the creative process of selecting a topic, penning a script, and relating a lively tale; it can also arouse students' engagement to perform outstandingly speaking skills (Razmi et al., 2014).

Interestingly, when the students created digital storytelling, they were also exposed to collaborative learning. Hence, the learning theory underpinning digital storytelling can be related to social constructivism learning theory based on Piaget's view of cognitive theory that addressed language learning can function in social interaction (Cohen, 2009). Vygotsky also (1978) argued that the way learners construct knowledge, think, reason, and reflect on is uniquely shaped by their relationship with others. Through digital storytelling via PowToon, students can be encouraged to achieve developmental

milestones through social and peer interaction. The EFL learners will undergo the learning process where they can strengthen the bonds between teacher and student and students with students to assist disabled students or students with learning difficulties (Psomos & Kordaki, 2012). The use of digital storytelling impacts students' technology literacy and social communication skills that can create a meaningful learning process. The elements of local contents elicited their interest when creating the script due to the connection of the local contents with their daily, cultural, and social activities. This immense benefit contributes to students' knowledge of their field of study, particularly on language, increase their academic achievement, and enhance their higher order thinking and artistic skill (Yuksel et al., 2011). Multimodal elements also play an essential role in energizing digital storytelling as the multimedia figures can arouse the students' interest in speaking rigorously and vividly. It is related to the new multimodal framework for digital storytelling by Kim et al. (2021), who underpin the sociocultural dimensions as one of the frameworks for using functional linguistics in English language learning. The presentation of digital storytelling is abundant in language learning, but the integration of local content-based multimodal approach is still limited. The role of English as a lingua franca has shaped a potential contribution for integrating local values as part of culture entity to develop the intercultural competence for language learners (Tuna & Razi, 2016).

Additionally, integrating local values based on a multimodal approach can synergize the elements in digital storytelling by combining visual, sound, movement, print-based text, and technology with local content elements. It can help EFL learners to obtain nuanced comprehension of the topic and improve their sense of accomplishment and self-esteem (Choi & Yi, 2016). The integration of multimodal elements will automatically help EFL learners to develop their communicative skills in a learner-centered environment (Razmi et al., 2014). Selection of modes such as visual, audio, text or speech can render framework for creative learning. The students will not necessarily obtain this experience when the storytelling is not mediated by multimodal elements (Marchetti & Cullen, 2015) .

14 Conclusion

This study investigated the effectiveness of digital storytelling based on multimodal elements on EFL learners speaking performance. The results show that the experimental group significantly outperformed the control group. It implicates that the use of digital storytelling incorporated with multimodal elements and local contents contribute enhancement in students' speaking performance in the aspects of sufficient control of simple grammatical forms, appropriate vocabulary, and sufficient control of phonological features when using utterances and word levels. Both control and experimental groups used the similar materials of creating storytelling and experienced process and feedback activities, it is believed that the contributing factors to students'

enhancement in speaking performance was the integration of digital application mediated by multimodal elements and values depicted from local values.

Digital storytelling with visual and auditory features can benefit meaningful, lively, and energetic language learning process. Learning process embodied with artistic, creative and collaborative learning can impart new knowledge and skills to the students. Also, the students were exposed to constructivism learning theory when creating digital storytelling, and it can promote students' agency for critical thinking, evaluation, and diverse point of view. The learning process is not only enriched from pedagogical aspects but also from digital and technological aspects. This study also researched student' perception on digital storytelling for language learning, and it is worth noting that students perceived it as enjoyable activity for narrating a story based-local content. Digital storytelling can be best used when the perceived obstacles examined to provide improved learning strategies. Factors such as digital and technical literacy, language skills, creativity and innovative thinking, and collaborative learning are worth considering when preparing the materials and conducting the teaching and learning activity.

The limitations of the study can be noted from the delivery of teaching and learning process through online platforms. The students were not specifically situated with peer assessment from their friends. The evaluation and feedbacks were only given by the lecturer without using exit survey for the stages of digital storytelling. The sample of the study was also relatively small, so the data sources cannot be generalized. Further study can integrate peer assessment with exit survey to give comprehensive evaluation and involve a larger proportional sample to provide generalizability of the data sources.

cek plagiarisme.docx

ORIGINALITY REPORT

10%

SIMILARITY INDEX

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	mafiadoc.com Internet	64 words — 1%
2	journals.iau.ir Internet	46 words — 1%
3	eprints.uny.ac.id Internet	37 words — 1%
4	pt.scribd.com Internet	34 words — 1%
5	www.psy.unibe.ch Internet	25 words — 1%
6	www.ukessays.com Internet	20 words — < 1%
7	eprints.undip.ac.id Internet	19 words — < 1%
8	these.univ-msila.dz Internet	19 words — < 1%
9	mjselt.com Internet	18 words — < 1%
10	repository.uinsu.ac.id Internet	

17 words — < 1%

11 etd1.library.duq.edu
Internet

16 words — < 1%

12 www.neliti.com
Internet

16 words — < 1%

13 academypublication.com
Internet

15 words — < 1%

14 journal.uniku.ac.id
Internet

14 words — < 1%

15 www.coursehero.com
Internet

12 words — < 1%

16 jurnal.unipasby.ac.id
Internet

11 words — < 1%

17 lib.ugent.be
Internet

11 words — < 1%

18 www.academypublication.com
Internet

11 words — < 1%

19 www.scribd.com
Internet

11 words — < 1%

20 atcm.mathandtech.org
Internet

9 words — < 1%

21 iceisr.com
Internet

9 words — < 1%

22 ijrcm.org.in

9 words — < 1%

23 Nur Khasanah, Mujiyem Sapti, Rintis Rizkia Pangestika. "Partisipasi Orang Tua Terhadap Pembelajaran Online di Rumah Ditinjau Dari Fase Kelas di Sekolah Dasar", *Journal of Digital Learning and Education*, 2021
Crossref

8 words — < 1%

24 onlinelibrary.wiley.com
Internet

8 words — < 1%

25 www.tandfonline.com
Internet

8 words — < 1%

26 Shaarawy, Hanaa Youssef, and Nohayer Esmat Lotfy. "Teaching Writing within the Common European Framework of Reference (CEFR): A Supplement Asynchronous Blended Learning Approach in an EFL Undergraduate Course in Egypt", *Higher Education Studies*, 2013.
Crossref

6 words — < 1%

EXCLUDE QUOTES OFF

EXCLUDE MATCHES OFF

EXCLUDE BIBLIOGRAPHY OFF